

EMNRD Study for Proposed Increases

Below are the current and proposed fees for NM State Parks

Fee Type	NM Current Cost	NM Proposed Cost	AZ Cost	CO Cost	NV Cost	TX Cost	UT Cost
Day Use (Resident)	\$5 per vehicle	Free for Residents	\$7-\$30	\$10	\$5-\$10	\$2-\$8	\$5-\$15
Day Use (Non-resident)	\$5 per vehicle	\$10 per vehicle					
Primitive Camping	\$8 per vehicle	\$20 per vehicle	\$15-\$25	\$14-\$18	\$15-\$18	\$5-\$15	\$10-\$15
Developed Camping	\$10 per vehicle	\$20 per vehicle	\$15-\$50	\$22-\$41	\$14-\$30	\$12-\$25	\$15-\$40
Utilities (Water, Electric,Sewer)	\$4 per day	\$10 per day					
Dump Station Fee	Free	\$10 per day					
Annual Day-Use Pass	\$40	Eliminate	\$75-\$200	\$80-\$120	\$75	\$100	\$125-\$175
Annual Camping Pass	\$180 (\$100-\$225)	Eliminate					
Living Desert Entrance Fee	\$.50-\$.5	\$1-\$10					

Combination of page 1 Exec Summary and page 5&6 from the study.

**Tx has a reduced rate to \$25 per person if in same household. Calculations are based off 2 adults and 2 kids.

Below shows the revenue Impact for said proposed changes.

Fee Type	NM Current Cost	NM Current Cost	Revenue Impact	% Increase
Day Use (Resident)	\$5 per vehicle	Free for Residents	\$ (862,500.00)	0%
Day Use (Non-resident)	\$5 per vehicle	\$10 per vehicle	\$ 575,000.00	100%
Primitive Camping	\$8 per vehicle	\$20 per vehicle	\$ 1,728,000.00	150%
Developed Camping	\$10 per vehicle	\$20 per vehicle	\$ 2,048,000.00	100%
Utilities (Water, Electric,Sewer)	\$4 per day	\$10 per day	\$ 700,000.00	150%
Dump Station Fee	Free	\$10 per day	\$ 250,000.00	%
Annual Day-Use Pass	\$40	Eliminate	\$ (295,400.00)	0%
Annual Camping Pass	\$180 (\$100-\$225)	Eliminate	\$ (457,000.00)	0%
Living Desert Entrance Fee	\$.50-\$.5	\$1-\$10	\$ 107,253.00	100%
		Loss Revenue	\$ (1,614,900.00)	
		Gained Revenue	\$ 3,793,353.00	After deducting 1.6mil Loss

Page 1 from Exec Summary with added percentage increases.

** Adding a fee of \$10 for a dump station not only adds a salary for a park employee to maintain but now introduces added risk to individuals dumping rv tanks on the beach or along roads. I have called 2 Bio-Waste companies here in ABQ to see what the charge would be to cleanup a bio-waste site containing urine and feces on dirt and both companies quoted a range fee of \$1000.00 - \$2000.00 to clean and haul off contaminated dirt not including travel expenses.

Annual Day Use Pass – A loss of \$295,400 is claimed in chart above however the executive summary or the study does not show actual figures of where this value derived from.

Annual Camping Pass

There is a discrepancy in revenue loss claimed. The previous page chart shows \$457,000.00 whereas the chart below shows a sum between the ACP types to be \$309,760.00. This variance is \$147,240.00. During the meeting in Elephant Butte I commented that the slide shown was not accurate to what was shown online. Mr Velasques commented back stating they were aware and will correct the slide on their presentation. So, they had several meetings previously with presenting inaccurate information????

Annual Camping Pass Revenue			
ACP Type	AVG ACP's Sold	AVG Revenue Generated	% Revenue Generated
Resident Senior	1474	\$ 147,300.00	48%
Resident	292	\$ 52,560.00	17%
Resident Disabled	189	\$ 18,900.00	6%
Non-Resident	398	\$ 89,550.00	29%
Replacement	145	\$ 1,450.00	0.50
	Total	\$ 309,760.00	

Taken from page 11 of the study

Vessel Registration

The below chart is Vessel registration increase on a 3yr cycle. I added the percentage for awareness.

Vessels Registration Increase 3yr Cycle			
Vessel Class	Current Reg Fee	Proposed Reg Fee	Percentage Increase of proposed Cost
Class A	\$28.50	\$83.67	193.57%
Class I: 16' to less than 26'	\$36	\$105.69	193.58%
Class II: 6' to less than 40'	\$43.50	\$127.70	193.56%
Class III: 40' to less than 65'	\$51	\$149.73	193.58%

Figures are from page 13 of the Study. Added the percentages for awareness.

Below is a chart showing a breakdown from 3yr to 1yr cycle of the current vessel registration of NM vs. surrounding states by a 1yr cycle. Some states were not reported on the study to have costs which is where "N/A" is shown.

Current Vessel Reg Fee Comparison 1yr Cycle				
State	Class A	Class I	Class II	Class III
New Mexico	\$9.50	\$12.00	\$14.50	\$17.00
Arizona	\$22.00	\$30.00	\$39.00	\$44.00
Colorado	\$35.25	\$45.25	N/A	\$75.25
Nevada	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Texas	\$16.00	\$26.50	\$55.00	\$75.00
Utah	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

Figures from surrounding states are from page 13 & 14 from the Study

Below is a chart showing the comparison of proposed increase of vessel registration NM vs. surrounding states on a 1yr cycle.

State	Class A Percent		Class I Percent		Class II Percent		Class III Percent	
	Class A Cost	Incr/Decr	Class I Cost	Incr/Decr	Class II Cost	Incr/Decr	Class III	Incr/Decr
New Mexico	\$ 27.89	N/A	\$ 35.23	N/A	\$ 42.56	N/A	\$ 49.91	N/A
Arizona	\$ 22.00	26.77%	\$ 30.00	17.43%	\$ 39.00	9.12%	\$ 44.00	13.43%
Colorado	\$ 33.25	-20.87%	\$ 45.25	-22.14%	N/A	N/A	\$ 75.25	-33.67%
Nevada	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Texas	\$ 16.00	74.31%	\$ 26.50	32.94%	\$ 55.00	-22.61%	\$ 75.00	-33.45%
Utah	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A

Figures are from Table 8 page 13 & 14 of the Study

Cost of Living Compared

2023 Annual Average Cost of Living

Rank	State	Index	Grocery	Housing	Utilities	Transportation	Health	Misc.
20	New Mexico	94.0	96.4	87.3	93.1	94.7	99.3	97.9
36	Arizona	108.4	102.2	124.1	95.3	106.1	93.8	104.1
35	Colorado	105.1	101.4	113.6	91.3	105.2	100.4	103.8
30	Nevada	101.0	102.9	107.4	99.1	116.6	91.7	91.6
19	Texas	92.7	95.7	83.1	104.0	91.8	93.9	96.4
34	Utah	103.2	99.3	110.7	94.9	105.1	91.0	101.9

<https://meric.mo.gov/data/cost-living-data-series>

Median Income Comparison

Median Income Compared to NM	FY 2022	Percentage Higher
New Mexico	\$ 58,722.00	0%
Arizona	\$ 72,581.00	26.60%
Colorado	\$ 87,598.00	49.17%
Nevada	\$ 71,646.00	22.00%
Texas	\$ 73,035.00	24.37%
Utah	\$ 86,833.00	47.87%

<https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table>

Electricity Cost Comparison

Cost of Electricity Compared to NM	Cost per kWh
New Mexico	\$ 0.16
Arizona	\$ 0.15
Colorado	\$ 0.15
Nevada	\$ 0.17
Texas	\$ 0.14
Utah	\$ 0.13

<https://www.energysage.com/local-data/electricity-cost>

NM's Economy

NM in 2021 sits #3 in the nation on the chart for highest poverty at 17.7%.







State	Number on Chart	Percent in poverty
New Mexico	3	17.70%
Arizona	20	12.90%
Colorado	49	9.70%
Nevada	13	14.00%
Texas	12	14.20%
Utah	51	8.70%

USDA table [\[edit\]](#)

• **Row numbers** are static. Other columns are sortable. This allows ranking of any column.

Links below are "Economy of STATE" links.

All people in poverty. Percent. 2021. US Department of Agriculture (USDA).^[2]

	States and D.C. ↕	All people in poverty (2021)				Children ages 0-17 in poverty (2021)		
		Percent ▾	90% confidence interval of estimate		Percent ↕	90% confidence interval of estimate		
			Lower Bound ↕	Upper Bound ↕		Lower Bound ↕	Upper Bound ↕	
1	 Louisiana	19.5	19.1	19.9	26.9	26.1	27.7	
2	 Mississippi	19.2	18.7	19.7	27.1	26.2	28	
3	 New Mexico	17.7	17.1	18.3	23.1	22.1	24.1	
4	 District of Columbia	16.8	15.9	17.7	25.5	22.5	28.5	
5	 West Virginia	16.8	16.3	17.3	21.4	20.5	22.3	
6	 Alabama	16.3	15.9	16.7	22.7	21.9	23.5	

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_U.S._states_and_territories_by_poverty_rate

Summary

Park Fees Current vs. Proposed

Fee Type	NM Current Cost	NM Propo Cost	Proposed Impact	% Increase	Number Used
Day Use (Resident)	\$5 per vehicle	\$5 per vehicle	\$ -	0%	172500
Day Use (Non-resident)	\$5 per vehicle	\$10 per vehicle	\$ 575,000.00	100%	115000
Primitive Camping (Resident)	\$8 per vehicle	\$10 per vehicle	\$ 120,000.00	25%	60000
Primitive Camping (Non-resident)	\$ -	\$15 per vehicle	\$ 720,000.00	100%	48000
Developed Camping	\$10 per vehicle	\$10 per vehicle	\$ -	0%	204800
Utilities (Water, Electric,Sewer)	\$4 per day	\$5 per day	\$ 116,666.00	25%	116666
Dump Station Fee	Free	Free	\$ -	0%	25000
Annual Day-Use Pass	\$40	\$60	\$ 147,700.00	46.61%	7385
Annual Camping Pass	\$180 (\$100-\$225)	\$200	\$ 50,780.00	11.11%	2539
Living Desert Entrance Fee	\$.50-\$.5	\$.5	\$ -	0%	21450
		Loss Revenue	\$ -		
		Gained Revenue	\$ 1,730,146.00		

1. Leave D/U Resident alone.
2. Increase D/U Non Resident by \$5 to generate \$575k
3. Increase Primitive Camping by \$2 to generate \$120k
4. Added Category Primitive Camping Non-Resident to generate \$720k
5. Increase Utilities by \$1 to generate \$116k
6. Dump Station – If imposed a budget for Bio-Waste must be created if not already there. I called 2- companies here in ABQ, both quoted Bio-Waste cleanup is \$1k-2k not including travel expense and tax. Basis was 80 gallons (40gal gray water & 40gal black water dumped in dirt)
7. ADU increase by \$20 to generate \$147k
8. Used \$180 as base dollar amt, increase by \$20 to generate \$50k
9. Leave living desert alone.

Annual Camping Pass

The variance of \$147,200.00 needs to be reviewed and identified. See top of page 2 from where the variance is derived from.

Vessel Registration Fees

1. The proposed fees are literally 3x of the current fee cost.
2. The bottom of page 2 shows a current apple to apple comparison of all surrounding states fees by class for a 1yr cycle.
3. The top of page 3 shows a chart of the proposed increases broken down to a 1yr cycle showing the percentage increase over the surrounding states. 95% of vessels in EB fall into the Class A and Class 1 category which is sitting 2nd highest among surrounding states after the increase.

Cost of Living

This chart on mid page 3 shows that NM is ranked #2 in the cheapest to live in vs. the surrounding states.

Median Income

This chart at the bottom of page 3 shows that New Mexico is the lowest of the surrounding states when it comes to median income. Nevada is the next highest compared to New Mexico and shows a 22% increase over the New Mexico median income.

Cost of Electricity

The chart at the top of page 4 shows that New Mexico is the 2nd highest compared to the surrounding states per kWh.

New Mexico's Economy Compared

This chart shown mid page 4 shows that New Mexico is ranked #3 in the nation in poverty.

In my deep dive of the study provided I find that NM simply cannot afford a huge increase in fees as proposed. This study covered a range of years that was highly impacted by COVID where several businesses suffered and are barely coming back out of the negative in the financial books. When comparing NM to the surrounding states the 20% + median income supports the Study fees of State parks. This study proposing high percentage increases would not only affect the State Parks but would also affect the local businesses as well. The risk is losing people/traffic to the State Parks which would result in negative revenue all around.

Reviewing the vessel side, the way the study was written is a red herring as it was written to show a vessel comparison of current fees on 1yr cycle but not written to show a comparison of inflation fees proposed on a 1yr cycle. Class A and Class I would have NM ranked as 2nd highest in fees should this proposal be passed.

Now with the new HB41 instated of a gas tax \$.50 per gallon this now makes getting to State Parks and enjoying State Parks with your proposed inflated fees to be more difficult to afford especially since 85% of the population in Elephant Butte is retired and on a fixed income.

Best Regards,

Chris Lucero